



C&TS Dispatch

Vol. 9 No. 3

FALL 1996

Horsing Around with Facts?

By Frances Melrose, Rocky Mountain News

New Mexican Rancher Spun Tall Tale of Equine Altruism

Sometimes tales of the Old West must be swallowed with a big dollop of salt. One such tale was given a large headline in a Denver newspaper in 1901. And now, here's the story. Do you believe it or not?

James H. George, a cattle and sheep raiser who lived near Chama, N.M., visited the Colorado Capitol Building late in May 1901, expressly, he said, to tell a horse story of such an unusual and startling nature that he wanted it put on record.

George maintained that the truth of his story could be vouched for by several citizens of Conejos and Archuleta counties, as

well as Rio Grande employees from that area. Those who were present at the telling of the story included Will H. Ferril, curator of the Colorado Historical Society, father of the late Thomas Hornsby Ferril, Denver poet and author.

George said that a few days before, he had been traveling by train from Chama to Denver. After the train had started down the eastern slope of Cumbres Pass, it stopped to board a passenger.

"I looked out the window," said George, "and saw a man dismount from a big black horse. He hurriedly unbuckled the saddle, took it off the horse and threw it into the baggage car. Then he rubbed the horse's nose a bit, patted its back, and as the train moved off, he ran and boarded the rear car."

The newcomer explained to George that he was a rancher on his way to Alamosa. He said he customarily on such trips rode over from his ranch, took care of the saddle and let the horse go home alone. On the return trip he had a ranchhand meet the train with an extra horse for the ride back to the ranch.

"But he never before had ridden this particular horse to the train," said George. "Instead of scampering away in the

See Horsing Around, page 4 ➔



The tale that is told in this newspaper report may have occurred on this trestle across the Rio de Los Pinos, which is six track miles east of Cumbres. But it may have occurred on one of the several trestles between Cumbres and the Los Pinos

water tank. Those trestles from the early years of the narrow gauge line long since have been replaced with graded roadbed. Art Nichols photo.

C&TS Dispatch

Directors

1996-1998	1995-1997
Roger Breeding	Howard Bunté
Roger Briggs	Wayne Freeark
Ralph G. Flowers	James Herron
Craig Kumler	William Lock
Donald Metzler	Warren Ringer
Arthur Nichols	Steven Schroeder
Drake Rice	Spencer Wilson
Theresa Shaw	
William Lock —Chairman of the Board	
President	Theresa Shaw
Vice President	Ralph G. Flowers
Treasurer	Robin Kumler
Secretary	James Herron

Editor **Arthur Nichols**

Please write the editor at
1307 45th Street, Los Alamos, NM 87544
e-mail: asn1307@aol.com

The C&TS Dispatch is published four times each year by the Friends of the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad, Inc., 5732 Osuna Road NE, Albuquerque, NM 87109. The Friends of the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad, Inc., is a New Mexico nonprofit corporation.

The Friends is the official museum support group for the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad, a 64-mile-long operating railroad and museum of railroad history and technology between Antonito, Colorado, and Chama, New Mexico. The railroad is owned by Colorado and New Mexico and is operated by Kyle Railways, Inc. As the museum support group, the Friends is dedicated to the preservation and interpretation of the railroad.

Family membership in the Friends is \$25.00 per year; outside the USA membership is \$35.00. All contributions are fully tax deductible and will be gratefully accepted. Please write us in Albuquerque or call us at (505) 880-1311 for information about the Friends. The Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad is both a National and a State Registered Historic Site.

Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad



Denver & Rio Grande Railway—1880 to 1886
Denver & Rio Grande Railroad—1886 to 1921
Denver & Rio Grande Western Railroad—1921 to 1970
Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad—1970 to 1996

© 1996 FRIENDS OF THE CUMBRES & TOLTEC SCENIC RAILROAD, INC.

PRESIDENT'S COLUMN



A major factor in the continuing success of our preservation efforts has been the cooperation we have fostered, enjoyed, and participated in with the Railroad Commission and Kyle Railways. A recent result of this cooperation is the newly adopted "Lettering Policy for the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad," presented on page 8.

Cooperation is necessary because three entities participate in the maintenance and operation of what is both a living museum and an operating railroad. The commission provides for the operation of the railroad through an agreement with Kyle Railways. The commission supports maintenance and restoration projects for cars and structures not involved in the direct operation of the railroad through its relationship with the Friends. Our organization was recognized as the official museum support group in the Triad Agreement signed in 1992 [published in our February 1993 issue, Vol. 6 No. 1].

A Triad Committee was created to meet as necessary to discuss issues of mutual interest. At a committee meeting in May 1996, the Friends initiated a number of items for discussion. The resulting recommendations were forwarded to the commission, and at a meeting in June the commission acted to approve them. Among them were three important policy documents: a Lettering Policy for the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad, a Long-Term Preservation Plan, and a Car Maintenance Plan (the latter two to be printed in future issues). All three of these documents began as memoranda for discussion by the Friends Board of Directors. Following circulation to the Executive Director and members of the Railroad Commission, the General Manager and Assistant General Manager of the railroad, and other interested persons, they were revised and presented for discussion at the committee's May meeting.

The lettering policy began development in early 1996 in response to concerns raised in letters to our editor, which are presented on page 10. The widest differences among the parties to the Triad Agreement concerned rotary snowplow OY, the Chama water tank, and the display locomotives in Antonito. Recognizing the benefits which each of us has seen from our cooperative efforts, the spirit of the May meeting was to reach agreement. We think these policies represent the best compromise for this time as we work to preserve the historical significance of this place and also support its present and ongoing identity.

—Terri Shaw 🍷

1996 SUMMER WORK SESSIONS



Anne and Frank Burton, recipients of the Friends' first Distinguished Service Award, with two of this year's recipients, J. Hawley Seely and John Carson (far right). The award was given at this year's annual meeting to Carson, Seely, and Harry Babcock (who was unable to attend), residents of Grand Junction, Colorado. They are all retired D&RGW carmen who volunteered in summer work sessions in the early years of the Friends, assisting with car construction and repair. They attended this year's work session as our guests to meet and consult with all of our car construction teams. They dispensed much good humor, wisdom, and encouragement.

As they have been doing since the founding of our organization in 1988, volunteers from throughout the United States and overseas came together in Antonito, Osier, Sublette, Cumbres, and Chama this summer to carry on the historic preservation work of the Friends of the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad. A complete report of this year's work session will be in the Winter issue of the C&TS Dispatch. *Photographs by Tom Cardin.* 🍷



- Left to right from top:*
- Volunteers worked on drop-bottom gondolas on the new spur track in Antonito.
 - The Sublette crew finished the exterior painting of the section house.
 - The team at Osier installed new doors and windows on the section house.
 - Volunteers at Cumbres replaced the roof of the Cumbres section house.
 - Volunteers were busy throughout the Chama yard.



Horsing Around

Continued from page 1

direction of the ranch, as the other animals had done, the horse began to follow the train.

"At first it acted like a dog that persists in following its master against the latter's wishes. It ran a ways up the track, then stopped, and gazed ahead wistfully. Finally the train increased its speed, and the horse ceased his rests and tried to keep up . . . The animal was running in the middle of the track and at an awful rate . . ."

The owner had been standing on the rear platform and was greatly distressed to see the horse following the train. He tried by voice and by gesture to make the animal turn around, but with no luck. Then the owner went inside, thinking that might make the horse give up and turn back. No such luck; the animal continued his wild gallop down the track.

The story spread through the train and most of the passengers crowded to the rear to watch the remarkable horse.

"I'll tell you it was worth seeing, too," related George. "After the train had gone about 4 miles down the pass, it suddenly slackened speed to keep from running into a herd of 16 horses that had broken through a fence and strayed onto the track. They quickly got off the track, however, but not before the horse in the rear had managed to reach the hind car and touch the platform with its nose . . ."

The horse gave a whinny of delight at getting so close to its master, but its happiness was short-lived, when the train picked up speed again.

The 16 horses that had been ahead of the train by then were grazing alongside the track. The faithful horse galloped past them without a sideways look.

"Presently we distinguished in the distance the entire herd of 16 horses coming down the track, single file," said George. "The one in the lead was about 300 yards behind the lone animal. Their curiosity had been aroused, and they were evidently

anxious to find out what the animal's game was.

"We were on a straight track now. Suddenly the train reached a high trestle and passed over it with a roar. (The trestle was 6 miles from where the horse's master had boarded the train.) Everybody on the train was on the tiptoe of excitement to see what our horse would do . . ."

The black horse came dashing on, never stopping at the brink of the bridge. Passengers were horror-stricken to see the horse go down between the ties of the trestle.

A mile beyond the trestle the train stopped for water, and the conductor ordered one of the trainmen to walk back and get the horse out of the trestle. The horse's owner, deeply affected by the accident, accompanied the trainman. George said he was determined to save the horse, and joined the other two in the rescue.

"The train then moved off and left us, and as we got around the curve we saw that the track ahead was filled with horse flesh . . . We realized that the bunch of horses were in dire distress over the misfortune that had come to their new acquaintance . . ."

At the trestle, George and his companions saw "our old friend with his legs dangling below the ties and his body above, entirely surrounded by the other horses.

"Two of them had hold of his mane with their teeth, two others were tugging away at his tail, and four more were pushing their heads down between the horse's body and the ties in an effort to turn the position of the animal so the others could get its legs clear.

"It was marvelous that the horses on the trestle retained their footing so well and did not fall through themselves . . . We could hardly believe our own eyes, but there it was . . . as noble an act of self-sacrifice and bravery as could be displayed by a human being . . .

"The eight horses that were doing the heavy work began to make progress . . . Presently with a tremendous effort, the

horse's body was lifted about two feet and rolled over on its side. This enabled the animal to get its front feet from between the ties and mount them on a tie. No bones were broken in the front legs, at least . . .

"The horse was still in a perilous position and nobody knew it better than itself . . . Four of the horses, two on each side, then put their heads under the animal's body, and assisted by two others that had the tail in their teeth, the hind part of the animal was lifted up until its hoofs touched the surface of the ties. Then the horse got a hold and stuck there. No bones were broken in these legs, either . . ."

The horse had been cut badly and was bleeding profusely. When the injured animal saw his master he showed great delight, despite his injuries, and followed the man to the nearest ranch house, where his wounds were treated.

The other horses, which had carefully picked their way off the trestle, reported George, "frisked about and were in apparent great delight over what had been accomplished . . ."

Soon after, a second section of the train arrived and was flagged down to pick up George and the men who had gone to the rescue. George said he marveled all the way to Denver over the remarkable sight he had witnessed.

"It certainly holds the record for animal intelligence," he commented.

Member Jack Schuh sent us this article, which appeared September 11, 1994, in the Rocky Mountain News. Reprinted with permission of the Rocky Mountain News. 🐾

NARROW GAUGE NEAR AND FAR: NO. 7

By Earl G. Knoob

Impressions from the mind of a 37-year-old who first visited Chama at the age of twelve in 1971

My first visit to Chama and the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad was on August 8, 1971. My father, younger brother, and I (all serious narrow gauge fans) were very excited about the preservation of the C&TS and made a plan to visit the historic railroad as part of our annual vacation. Because we had no idea about lodging in Chama, we stayed in Durango and made a couple of day trips to Chama on August 8 and 9.

My first view of the C&TS was crossing the wye and seeing the stock pens and a long string of stock cars (owned by the scrapper of the line to Durango) down by the end of track. The parking lot was closed by a gate. An armed guard cheerfully had us sign the guest book and told us to have fun. Over by the engine house was a line of locomotives—all rather beat up looking. I was thrilled to see 487. It was the first “live” narrow gauge engine I had ever seen back in Durango in 1967—and it was saved.

After the engine house we checked out the coal tipple, water tank, and work equipment. I took lots of photos with my Instamatic. I look back at these and marvel at the changes that have taken place over twenty-five years. The big warehouse in the yard which took up one-third of the parking lot is gone now, as is the big smokestack on the engine house roof. But now we have a real shop, and things generally look healthier. How those guys kept all this running with so little back in 1971 is amazing to me today.

After lunch we checked out the strings of freight cars south of the depot. Virtually every car still wore its 1950s (or earlier) D&RGW paint. We spent hours wandering down between two tracks to the end, then back up between two others. I was fascinated. Before long we headed back to Durango for the night.



Six engines in the Chama yards on January 17, 1971. Ernest Robart photo.

We were back in Chama about 8:30 the next morning. Engine 484—with a boxcar coupled to its tender—had backed into the east stall in the engine house (or as much as it could). We watched and photographed the crew cleaning the fire, coaling the tender at the tipple, and backing down to the train. We eagerly climbed aboard to await departure.

Promptly at 10:00 engine 484 whistled off and headed bravely out of Chama with its 11 car train. I rode in the first car all the way to Cumbres. Back then the two restroom cars (250 and 251) were also snack cars. The concession space was in the end opposite the restrooms. There were no seats, just benches with lockers underneath down the walls. I spent most of the day kneeling on the locker hanging out the window. What a show. One of the things I remember most about the trip was that the entire crew (except the engineer) consisted of young guys in their 20s. The Silverton Branch appeared to be populated with old guys who probably worked there all their lives (quite true). But here on the C&TS were guys only 8 to 10 years my senior actually running a narrow gauge train! I can do this! At this point I think my life began an irreversible spiral into narrow gauge oblivion.

I don't remember all the crew that day, but I remember John Oldberg being the

conductor. Sid McKinney (an old retired Santa Fe engineer) was engineer and Rich Braden was the fireman. Many years later I would become good friends with Rich and rent his home in Chama between 1983 and 1990. I have met and gotten acquainted with John Oldberg. John was later promoted to the position I have with the C&TS today.

The rest of the trip was very memorable. I remember seeing flames coming out around the right cylinder of the 484 near Los Pinos. After a quick stop, we were underway again. Twenty-five years later 484 will still do this on occasion. Grass gets caught up behind the rear cylinder head cover and packs around the hot cylinder head. With enough heat and some fresh air, it will burst into flames.

We stopped at Sublette and everyone got off for an impromptu photo run. With a blast on the whistle and mighty slip of the drivers, 484 came charging around the curve and whipped past at what seemed like high speed (probably 12 mph). Looking back, it was a great trip. For the \$13.50 it cost then, it was a bargain.

Although my family probably regrets letting me see Chama, I think it was the start of something great.

Earl is Superintendent of Operations of the C&TS and a consulting director of the Friends. 🐾

PRESERVATION PERSPECTIVE: NO. 5

A Car Preservation Facility?

By Keith E. Hayes, AIA

Many museums and railroad groups have a large building in which to disassemble and rebuild railroad cars and locomotives. Often, these buildings were inherited from a railroad, as at the Nevada Northern and East Broad Top railroads. Several new facilities have been constructed where buildings were removed or destroyed, as at Durango, Colorado, and Cass, West Virginia, and sometimes, new buildings have been constructed where none existed, as at the Illinois Railroad Museum. Such facilities enable museum volunteers and staff to perform preservation projects under cover from weather over long periods of time.

The idea of a preservation facility for the repair and restoration of rolling stock on the C&TS began to develop in the late 1980s when the Friends sought to restore rotary snowplow OM to operation for its 100th birthday in 1989. After some initial planning, the evaluation team discovered the project would require complete disassembly of the wood cabin which shelters the boiler and operating mechanism! The initiative was abandoned when the volunteers recognized it would take multiple work sessions to complete the work: they felt it would not be advisable to leave the snowplow in pieces over the two or three years it would take to complete the project.

By the beginning of the decade, the Friends realized that a car preservation facility was becoming more and more desirable. In 1990, they developed some sketches for a shop facility to be built in Chama, and the Railroad Commission approved the building in concept in early 1991. However, further development of the idea was delayed as energy was focused on the growth of the organization and the attention that remaining structures along the line needed.

In early 1995, the Board of Director's discussion about the need for a facility resumed. In the spring, the Triad Committee discussed the concept and a task force with representatives of the Friends, Kyle Railways, and the Railroad Commission established basic spatial requirements and surveyed potential sites in Chama and Antonito.

In the summer of 1995, the Triad Committee recommended to the Railroad Commission that a repair and restoration facility was worth pursuing, with the Friends finding the money to construct such a facility, which would become the property of the commission. The Triad Committee's recommendation for the preferred location of a facility, the area east of and below the rail yard and south of the engine house in Chama, was accepted. And the commission approved having the Friends continue to study this site.

Many dedicated members have contributed their time and expertise to the conceptual planning and feasibility studies for a car preservation facility. Such a facility would be the most ambitious and far-reaching project undertaken so far by the Friends, and an appreciation of the many considerations that must be taken into account in planning for a facility may be gained by recounting the questions raised at a meeting in the summer of 1995.

About twenty team leaders, board members, and other interested members met in the Chama depot during the work sessions to discuss a repair and restoration facility. The discussion ranged from the proper size of a facility, to where it should be located, how it would be built, how much it would cost, and how it would be paid for and maintained. I was at the meeting and observed different points of view.

A few members believed that the recommended location may be too isolated. It is away from the roundhouse and depot, the center of daily activity in Chama. Being in the yard gives us high visibility during our work

sessions, creating enthusiasm and camaraderie among the volunteers and an opportunity to explain our work to the public. Most of those present at the meeting felt that even with a repair and restoration facility we should always carry on some of our projects in the yard.

Others asked if construction of such a facility in Chama would be the most effective way to accomplish the Friends' long-term objectives. The Friends have built and used a spur track in Antonito for repair of flat cars and drop-bottom gondolas; it could be expanded.

Several members who spoke felt that our preservation activities with respect to certain cars require such a facility. There are a number of cars which may require complete disassembly. Work on them probably cannot be carried out without an enclosed facility. The proposed projects represent a new level of rigor: entire car bodies would be disassembled to repair and replace decayed structural components. Such projects would stretch over multiple work sessions and take years to complete. The lack of a facility may limit the scope of work the Friends can perform, and construction of additional trackage in the area of the proposed facility would also provide a location for preservation work and storage without interfering with the daily operation of the railroad.

Another big question is who would work in the car preservation facility? If the facility has heat, it would be possible for work to occur on a year round basis. Yet, will enough of us drive to Chama or Antonito to do this work throughout the year? This is a concern because of the distance of Chama and Antonito from the population centers of Denver and Albuquerque. Also, questions were raised about how many of our potential workers have the skills to do advanced carpentry, metal work, fine wood work and inlay, and upholstery, to name a few. Some members wondered about



making such an effort if the facility would not be used for much of the year. As an alternative, others asked if hiring individuals or contractors to do the work would be a possibility? Would it be a better use of funds?

What will a repair and restoration facility cost? The minimal facility that has been discussed—with space for working on two passenger cars—is estimated to cost \$500,000. And when we restore a passenger car, don't we need a covered display and storage area to best preserve the investment? Some members wondered if the cost could be reduced by having the Friends construct the facility during a future

work session. Others suggested that construction take place in phases: this would spread out the fund raising and might allow work to begin without committing to a final design.

Meanwhile, the board has moved ahead—at their spring meeting this year, the directors approved the concept of phased development of a facility, looking toward the installation of track and a concrete pad, and they are investigating sources for 70- or 85-lb rail classified as "re-lay." A team surveyed and studied the recommended site during this year's work sessions.

Further discussion and planning will occur at the Board of Directors fall meeting November 8 and 9. The directors welcome comments from the membership. Let them know what you think.

Keith's column appears regularly in the C&TS Dispatch. Reports to the membership on the status of a car preservation facility will be presented in future issues. 🍂

Commission Meeting Highlights

By Leo Schmitz—Executive Director, Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad Commission

June 14, 1996, Chama, New Mexico. The railroad has increased its efforts to prevent and suppress fires during spring drought conditions. There is a water car with sprinklers on each side that runs on each train from Chama to Cumbres. In addition, a motor car and a road truck, both equipped with fire fighting equipment, follow the morning and afternoon trains. [The water car and road truck have been discontinued since the beginning of the summer rains.] General Manager Joe Vigil also reported that Jack Campbell has assumed the engine shop duties of John Bush, who has resigned to take a position with the White Pass and Yukon.

The Railroad Commission has received four grants for constructing two passenger cars. The grants are from USDA/Rural Development, \$75,000; Boettcher Foundation, \$30,000; Gates Foundation, \$30,000; and US West Foundation, \$10,000. The cars will be built this winter in the Antonito shop.

The Intermodal Surface Transportation Efficiency Act (ISTEA) project to build a retention pond in Chama for storm water run-off from the parking lot and around the depot is in the

design stage. The retention pond will also handle the storm water and the waste water from the Chama shop.

The commission unanimously approved several actions that had been recommended by the Triad Committee. (1) The Friends' efforts to acquire and return to the railroad two stock cars located on the Jicarilla Indian Reservation in Dulce, New Mexico. (2) The installation by the Friends of a second track near Ft. Knox in Antonito for their restoration activities. (3) The Friends negotiations for the purchase and return to the railroad of two Gramps tank cars located in La Jara, Colorado. (4) The adoption of the Long-Term Preservation Plan and the Car Maintenance Plan, which the Triad Committee reviewed and revised [these plans will be presented in a future issue of the C&TS Dispatch]. (5) The Lettering Policy approved by the Triad Committee [the policy is presented on page 8].

The commission approved a request from the National Rocky Mountain Narrow Gauge Railroad Museum to allow the placing of a directional sign to the museum on commission property. The commission approved the request contingent upon the museum obtaining approval from the New Mexico State Highway Department and the Village of Chama, with the approval being revokable at the will of the commission.

The officers for the coming year will be Lewis Entz, Chairman; Robert Lynn, Vice Chairman; Wayne Quinlan, Secretary; and Medardo Sanchez, Treasurer. The Railroad Commission's representative to the Triad Committee will be Medardo Sanchez.

Fall News and Events Election Results

The results of the election for openings on the Board of Directors were announced at the Annual Meeting held in Chama on July 26. The following directors were re-elected to two-year terms (the number of votes for each candidate is also given). Roger Breeding, 474; Roger Briggs, 477; Ralph Flowers, 478; Craig Kumler, 474; Art Nichols, 477; Drake Rice, 475; and Terri Shaw, 472. Joining the board for a two-year term is Don Metzler (475).

Appointments

Continuing and new appointments were made at the Board of Directors meeting held in Chama on July 21, 1996. Theresa Shaw, Ralph Flowers, Robin Kumler, and James Herron will continue as officers of the corporation. Roger Briggs will continue as the Colorado Representative to the Executive Committee, and Arthur Nichols will be the New Mexico Representative. Continuing as representatives to the Railroad Commission are Ralph Flowers, Wayne Freeark, William Lock, and Spencer Wilson. President Theresa Shaw (or her

See News, page 9 ➔

Lettering Policy for the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad

The Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad Commission adopted the following lettering policy at its June 14, 1996, meeting in Chama, New Mexico. This policy was recommended to the Railroad Commission by the Triad Committee, which is composed of representatives from the Railroad Commission, the Operator, and the Friends.

Whereas, the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad is owned by the States of Colorado and New Mexico and is a very historic property; and

Whereas, the Friends of the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad has requested that the Commission adopt a policy regarding the lettering of engines, cars, and structures on the historic property; and

Whereas, the Triad Committee, consisting of the owner Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad Commission [hereinafter referred to as the "Commission"], the operator Kyle Railways [hereinafter referred to as the "Operator"], and the support group Friends of the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad, Inc. [hereinafter referred to as the "Friends"] have recommended the following policies to be adopted by the Commission; and

Whereas, the Commission at its regular meeting held on June 14, 1996, has adopted the following policies.

NOW, THEREFORE, the following policies are hereby adopted by the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad Commission as the lettering policy for the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad:

1. The Commission owns the Railroad and is the entity to adopt policies concerning lettering.

2. There are sometimes conflicting interests created by the fact that the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad is both a living museum and an operating railroad, and by the existence of three entities interested in continuing and

maintaining this dual operation—the Commission, the Operator, and the Friends.

3. The Friends' mission is a mixed one, both to preserve and interpret the historic railroad as well as to support the operation of the C&TSRR. The Friends would like the entire property to retain its historic look to the greatest extent possible and would like as much historic equipment as possible to be lettered D&RGW.

4. The Operator is not operating just a historic railroad, it operates the C&TSRR. This railroad is now almost 26 years old, and it continues in business because tourists and railfans come to ride the train and see the historic equipment in action. Part of the attraction is the historic place and historic equipment, but the Operator also has a strong interest in creating a recognizable name and place to attract people to visit and return to. The C&TSRR is a place that exists now.

5. The operating engines, non-historic passenger coaches, converted boxcar coaches, observation gondolas, and cabooses 0306 and 05635 are currently lettered C&TSRR. They are used regularly in the operation of the tourist railroad. This lettering practice is proper as to the passenger cars because they are either not historic or have been significantly changed from their historic configuration. The engines are more of a gray area. Railfan charters may, at their option and expense, have the engine tenders relettered D&RGW. The Friends and the Commission recognize the interest of the Operator in advertising and agree the current practice is a good compromise.

6. The freight and company service cars are not used in everyday service. When they are used, it is usually in a charter train for railfans who would prefer to see the equipment labeled D&RGW. Lettering the historic freight cars C&TSRR would not affect the marketing of the Railroad to tourists. The Friends paints and letters almost all of the freight and company service cars and has generally relettered these cars as they were before being painted. Generally, all freight and company service equipment should be lettered

D&RGW. If appropriate, one of the Rio Grande heralds in use in the 1920–1940 period could be placed on the car. The Friends has lettered some cars C&TSRR in the past, and the Friends will repaint and reletter these cars D&RGW as time and resources permit.

7. There are a few pieces of equipment whose status is not well defined:

a) Rotary snowplow OY has been extensively overhauled by the Operator and has been repainted this spring. The Friends would prefer to see it labeled D&RGW. (Were the Friends to paint OM, OP, OB, etc., the Friends would expect to letter them D&RGW.) Of all the lettered work cars, OY continues to be used in C&TSRR operations. The Friends recognizes that when OY is in use it is an event that draws many observers and that the Operator has an interest in having its name before the public at such times. As a compromise the Triad Committee recommended that OY be lettered C&TSRR.

b) Historic caboose 0503 is currently labeled D&RGW and should remain that way. The Friends will be beginning work on a restoration plan for caboose 0579 in Antonito that will take it back to a D&RGW configuration, and it should be relettered historically as part of its restoration.

c) The display engines in Antonito do not currently function as part of the operating railroad. The Friends would like to see them lettered D&RGW as are the other cars on the display track, but recognize that they are presently a form of advertising. Without other explanatory signs in the yard, visitors could be confused and the current lettering serves to help visitors locate the C&TSRR. Therefore these engines (494 and 495) should remain lettered C&TSRR.

d) The three hopper cars are from BA&P not historic to the railroad. The Friends do not contemplate either painting or lettering them and they should be lettered C&TSRR.

8. Most of the structures do not display the name of the Railroad, so in a sense the structures are less of a problem than the rolling stock. The primary →

structures that historically displayed the name of the Railroad appear to be the depots. Some old photos of the depots show the station name on the end with a D&RGW herald underneath. Research to date has not found a picture of the Chama depot that shows the herald. In *Chama/Cumbres, With a Little Chili* (R. L. Dorman, 1988), the Chama depot has no herald in the frontispiece. Page 70 shows the Cumbres depot with a herald, and page 71 shows it without a herald. The herald is prominent on the end of the Espanola depot in the picture on page 168. In Chama and Antonito, since the depots serve as ticket offices, it is only reasonable to expect that the Operator will want them to show the current name of the railroad if they display any name at all. (The Operator is responsible for painting the depots in Chama and Antonito.) As the Antonito depot is not historic, it would not be correct to place a D&RGW herald on it in any case. Research to date has not found any photo showing a herald on a depot if the depot was painted dark, presumably the dark reddish-brown color now on the building at Osier. It seems the herald was placed on the depots only if they were white or yellow. Thus, it seems it would be incorrect to place a herald on the Osier depot. Research to date has found no photos showing a herald on the Osier depot.

9. The section houses generally showed the location. At Sublette, for example, the name Sublette appears on a sign by the tracks and on the north and east sides of the section house in photos taken around 1968–1970. There are only three section houses left; and the Friends paint the section houses. Since Osier and Sublette are far from any well-traveled roads, there would be no advertising value in placing a C&TSRR herald on buildings there—the tourists on the train should already know the name of the Railroad. Cumbres is an unusual case since the depot has been removed and the section house is now perceived more like a depot. And it is close to a major road. If more research

cannot produce evidence of the herald on section houses, it is recommended that no herald be placed on the Cumbres section house.

10. The railroad name or a herald was sometimes placed on water tanks. (The trouble with water tank pictures is that you never know if there was the railroad name or a herald on the side of the tank away from the photographer.) The picture from 1960 on page 14 of *Chama/Cumbres, With a Little Chili* shows the Chama water tank with the flying Rio Grande on it. The picture from 1963 on page 56 of this work



Richard Caldwell (left) and Malcolm Merrihew lining up lettering stencils on a drop-bottom gondola in the Chama yard during the "B" work session, July 1996. Tom Cardin photo.

shows the same lettering on the Cresco tank. In *Alamosa/Salida, and the Valley Line* (R. L. Dorman, 1991), a photograph on page 9 shows the Antonito tank in 1948. It is faint, but the tank appears to have the flying Rio Grande on it. A photo from 1939 (page 125) in this volume shows a herald on one of the twin tanks at Salida. There are numerous pictures in both these volumes that show the water tanks painted a dark color and no name or a herald on any tank painted a dark color can be discerned. It would appear that, like the depots, the railroad name or a herald was placed on water tanks only after the lighter colors had been adopted. Photos of the Osier tank from both circa 1918 (*Chama/Cumbres, With a Little Chili*, pages 116–119) and circa 1960 show it painted dark.

The Railroad now has seven operating water tanks: Chama, Cresco, Cumbres,

Los Pinos, Osier, Sublette, and Antonito. The Operator is responsible for the maintenance of these tanks. The tanks at Cumbres and Sublette are underground; the remaining tanks are all painted yellow. The Triad Committee recommended that the tanks along the line show no name or herald or the flying Rio Grande or a Rio Grande herald.

The Friends would have preferred the same for the tanks at Chama and Antonito but recognize their secondary advertising function. The tank in Antonito is not historic but the one in Chama is a restoration. John Rupley's

article in the Winter 1995 C&TS Dispatch notes: "Photographs from the 1950s show the flying Rio Grande logo on the water tank." Other photographs indicate that the lettering had been changed to C&TSRR in the early 1970s. As a compromise, the Triad Committee recommended the current lettering on the Chama and Antonito tanks be Cumbres & Toltec.

The Lava tank is not in use and the Friends are responsible for painting it. Given its remote location and the

difficulty of access, it is unlikely that the Friends would choose to place any lettering on the tank were the Friends to paint it again. 🖐

News

Continued from page 7

delegee) will continue as the Friends' member of the Triad Committee. The board renewed the appointment of William Lock to the honorary office of Chairman of the Board. Reappointed Consulting Directors were Frank Burton, Earl Knoob, Leo Schmitz, and Joe Vigil.

Friends on the Internet

Member Don Richter of Denver has created a homepage for the Friends on the Internet. Don developed the page as an extension of his personal homepage located on CompuServe. The address is <http://ourworld.compuserve.com/homepages/drichter/focts.htm>

LETTERS

From the Commission's Executive Director

The question has been raised, why was the flying Cumbres & Toltec logo placed on the restored Chama water tank? The issue of what if any lettering to apply to the restored water tank was discussed in the planning process for the restoration of the tank in the spring of 1994, between Red Mountain Engineers, Kyle Railways, management, and myself as commission representative.

We chose to have the flying Cumbres & Toltec logo placed on the tank for the following reasons. This is now the Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad and has been operated as such for twenty-five years. While we are trying to preserve the railroad, the facilities, and the history, the C&TS is not the Denver & Rio Grande Western Railroad. The C&TS is an operating railroad and has worked long and hard to establish its own identity in the competitive tourist marketplace. It is the tourists who come and ride the railroad that provide the revenue to keep the C&TS operating. Also, the water tank is a highly visible structure from the highway, and the advertising value of placing the Cumbres & Toltec name on the tank was considered advantageous as opposed to leaving the tank unlettered.

The Railroad Commission, the Friends, and Kyle Railways, Inc., are now reviewing the larger issue of lettering the rolling stock and the structures . . .

*Leo Schmitz
Executive Director
Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad
Commission
April 1996*

*Following the review by the Railroad Commission, the Friends, and Kyle Railways, Inc., the commission adopted a lettering policy at its meeting on June 14, 1996. The policy is presented on page 8.
—the editor*

C&TS or D&RGW?

The letters below were received from members in response to the article on the restoration of the Chama water tank, which appeared on page one of the Winter 1995 issue. The letters present different points of view about the lettering of the tank, in particular, and with the lettering policy of the railroad, in general.

Congratulations to all involved with the Chama water tank restoration. It's a first rate job, befitting one of the centerpieces of the entire Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad. Yet there is one aspect of the restoration that does not sit well with me, and that is the decision to put "Cumbres & Toltec" on the tank.

Now don't get me wrong, I'm proud of the C&TS, and the passenger trains should be painted and lettered C&TS. After 25 years, that is the marketing image of the railroad. Our friends over in Durango have taken this view to the point that almost everything over there is lettered "Durango & Silverton." This is quite legitimate, as a private company bought an active railroad and names it what they pleased.

The Cumbres & Toltec, however, is a different story. A major part of the reason for saving the line was to preserve a slice of history. But history is a funny animal. Until 1968 the railroad consisted entirely of the various incarnations of the D&RGW. After that, of course, the C&TS has been a part of that history too. Whose history do we preserve? D&RGW? C&TS? Both?

In my view, I just don't see how the historical section of the railroad can be both. The Friends labor to paint and letter equipment in historic D&RGW paint schemes. Yet there are enough cars lettered C&TS that nearly every photo freight has one bobbing along somewhere in the consist.

The real problem, though, is not how a few freight cars or a water tank are painted. It is the effect of little changes, one at a time over the years, that makes a big impact. For example,

in 1970 the original volunteers, with the best intentions, lettered the oil house "Cumbres & Toltec Scenic Railroad." Although faded, the building still says that today. Another example is the water tank at Osier. Although it was red when the states bought the railroad, the tank has been yellow so long that the yellow now seems normal.

Whatever decisions we make concerning how something is restored or painted can have long-term consequences. The people who will visit the railroad 10 years from now are at our mercy today. We can either have a first rate museum with a common theme to the entire property or we can have a mishmash of exhibits that don't complement each other.

Even though the Chama water tank is an active part of the Cumbres & Toltec's modern passenger business, it is still a museum piece. And a little bit of the historic fabric of our museum has been changed.

*Les Jarrett,
Indianapolis, IN
January 1996*

I just received my C&TS Dispatch for Winter 1995, and I am compelled to voice my opinion regarding the restoration of the Chama water tank. I am happy the structure was restored for posterity, but I am afraid in the process a bit of history is now lost. I am referring to the flying Cumbres & Toltec lettering that was applied to the painted water tank. I cannot understand why a historic minded organization, and the commission, who are usually so historically correct in their restoration projects, can be inconsistent at times with things like lettering. The tank and all the structures were constructed for and by the Rio Grande. That flying Cumbres & Toltec logo, while cute, has no historic value to the Rio Grande or the C&TS history and only adds to confusion that many people already experience. ➔

We are all supposed to remember the Rio Grande, and restore to their standards, but when it comes to lettering there is no clear answer . . . I am heartened to see the Friends restoring freight cars, and relettering them Rio Grande, with original style letters and numbers. However some cars have C&TS and some Rio Grande, which makes no sense to me . . .

As a photographer and Video producer I am a little biased on this issue, I admit . . . Authenticity will draw historically minded railfans and photographers to the railroad, which is most of the appeal of the place. The water tank has always been a favorite location for yard shots, in fact, on my charter train in May 1993 we did a run-by near the tank depicting a freight arriving from Cumbres, then later another one near the coaling tower.

Having been to this railroad off and on over 4 decades beginning in 1958, I have seen a lot of changes, including the Rio Grande lettering on the tanks, especially the fading lettering on the Cresco tank. The other tanks that have been restored bear no name on them, and in my mind that is better than C&TS.

There are those who say it isn't the Rio Grande anymore, and I can understand some things need to stay C&TS for the public. But from a view of history there is nothing wrong with riders being told how painstakingly the structures were restored to preserve them and to make them historical in appearance as well—right down to the old Rio Grande lettering . . .

I would be interested in responses from members, and I would be willing to chair a fund raising committee that would pay for relettering to Rio Grande, should that be a possibility.

Greg Scholl
Batavia, OH
February 1996

The most recent restoration of the Chama water tank was a large undertaking by both the Friends and the C&T. The continuing efforts of both are very important to the survival of

what the Denver & Rio Grande Western Railroad was. One thing that really bothers me is why the Cumbres & Toltec logo is on the tank.

I think that this is wrong . . . Why is the C&T logo not only on the tank but on many of the freight cars as well? They all worked for the D&RGW. I don't have a problem with the coaches being lettered for the C&T, they are not original anyway. I think that the Friends and the C&T should really work on what are "we" trying to preserve.

Other buildings and freight cars have been restored to their D&RGW paint . . . the buildings, locomotives, and freight cars should retain their proud D&RGW name . . . Nothing is more frustrating than seeing pictures or videos of the freights that occasionally operate on the C&T, but seeing various locomotives and freight cars as D&RGW and C&T. Just what is the preservation of the former D&RGW supposed to be?

Tim Daubert
Fall City, WA
January 1996

The restoration of the Chama water tank was a project of the Railroad Commission and Kyle Railways.
—the editor

Answers to questions about whether equipment and structures should be lettered for the C&TS or the D&RGW can be found in the purpose of the Friends. I believe the organization's intent is to preserve the property as it existed sometime prior to 1970. Furthermore, the whole premise for getting the states to purchase the railroad was to save this piece of history. The symbol used on the property prior to that year was D&RGW. Reading literature from the Friends, I see that the two most often used words are "historically accurate." Prior to 1970, there isn't anything historically accurate about the C&TS!

All equipment and structures with origins from the D&RGW or its predecessor, the D&RG, should be lettered as such with following exceptions.

1. Equipment that has been extensively altered to an appearance different from that when it was in service should not be lettered for the D&RGW. The passenger boxcars are a perfect example. This is not to say the lettering, car numbers, and historical origins of this equipment are not important—just not appropriate to a scene prior to 1970. The steel replica passenger cars should not be lettered for the D&RGW . . .

2. The UTLX tank cars—which were in service at a time prior to 1970 but always carried UTLX markings.

Non-operating locomotives (483, 492, 494, and 495) should be lettered D&RGW.

I will address the Chama water tank specifically. This structure helps set the atmosphere for the railroad environment. The environment to be preserved is historical in nature, and therefore the tank should be marked for the D&RGW. It seems counterproductive going to great lengths lettering a railroad car historically accurate when the setting or background scene (read—Chama water tank lettered C&TS) doesn't fit. Examples of structures that should not have D&RGW marking are the depot and engine house in Antonito as they are post D&RGW.

Some may argue that since the water tank has been rebuilt recently, much of it being replaced with new materials that have not witnessed the parade of thirsty locomotives pulling pipe trains and stock extras, it is not historical and does not fit the criteria outlined above. I counter that when the tank was rebuilt, meticulous attention to detail was given to ensure that the appearance of the new tank copied the old. It certainly is important to document which parts are original and authentic and which parts are replacements. The care and consideration given for exact replication of all details justify lettering the tank as the original was lettered—Rio Grande in this case!

Randall S. Worwag
Arvada, CO
March 1996



Saturday, July 27, 1996, was a great day for railroading. The Friends' railfan photo excursion, Freight Train to Toltec, and the daily passenger train were combined on the run from Chama to Cumbres. The road engine on the

charter was 497 with 484 as the helper. Engine 488 powered the passenger train. Freight Train to Toltec included freight cars restored by the Friends, including the tank cars brought back from Alaska. Tom Cardin photo.



**Friends of the Cumbres & Toltec
Scenic Railroad, Inc.**

5732 Osuna Road NE
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87109

ADDRESS CORRECTION REQUESTED

Non-Profit
Organization
U.S. Postage
PAID
Albuquerque, NM
Permit No. 1710